Exploring the Status Quo of All-for-one Tourism Development in Meishan City, China: Insights from Local Travel Influencers

Jianwei Ding¹, Md Azalanshah Md Syed², Rosya Izyanie Shamshudeen³

¹PhD candidate, Department of Media and Communication Studies, University of Malaya, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia
²Associate Professor (PhD), Department of Media and Communication Studies, University of Malaya, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia
³Senior Lecturer (PhD), Department of Media and Communication Studies, University of Malaya, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia

Correspondence: Rosya Izyanie Shamshudeen, Department of Media and Communication Studies, University of Malaya, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia.

Received: August 24, 2023 Accepted: October 1, 2023 Online Published: October 3, 2023
doi:10.11114/v11i7.6329 URL: https://doi.org/10.11114/v11i7.6329

Abstract

All-for-one tourism is a newly proposed concept that aims to promote the transformation of national tourism development in China. Few research studies have focused on the current industry practice of all-for-one tourism in China. A qualitative case study, grounded in an interpretivist paradigm, was conducted to investigate the status quo of all-for-one tourism development in Meishan City, China. In-depth interviews were conducted with 15 local travel influencers based on opinion leadership theory. Thematic content analysis was utilized to analyze study data. Study findings revealed that implementing all-for-one tourism was limited by the lack of a clear tourism strategy, uncoordinated development, and low-quality public services. But efforts had been made to support all-for-one tourism in the public service system, tourism supply chain, tourism market order, destination brand strategy, and marketing effectiveness.

Keywords: all-for-one tourism, opinion leadership theory, travel influencers, Meishan City, China

1. Introduction

The World Travel and Tourism Council (2023) states that the travel and tourism industry contributed to one-fourth of all new job opportunities and 10.3 percent of global GDP before the COVID-19 outbreak in 2019. Therefore, the significance of the tourism industry cannot be overlooked in countries that are popular tourism destinations. China’s rich cultural and historical heritage, ancient artifacts and architecture, and diverse natural attractions make it one of the most popular tourist destinations for international and domestic tourists. China’s tourism industry contributed to 11.05% (10.94 trillion Yuan) of its total GDP in 2019 (Xinhua, 2020).

However, the demands of mass tourism surpass China’s traditional scenic spot tourism pattern. Notably, the fewer tourists are visiting traditional scenic spots while more tourists are visiting non-scenic spots. Currently, more than 65 percent of all the tourists visiting China prefer to visit non-scenic touristic regions in eastern China (Laiye, 2018). The concept of ‘all-for-one tourism’ was initially proposed by the National Tourism Administration in 2015 to promote high-quality tourism development; a concept that attracted the attention of many academics. Later, the concept was officially documented in China’s Governmental Work Report in 2017 (China State Council, 2017). Subsequently, all-for-one tourism was positioned as a national tourism strategy in the Guidance for Promoting All-for-one Tourism Development that was issued and implemented by the National State Council in 2018 (Li, 2018). Li (2018) defines all-for-one tourism as the tourism industry being the leading industry within and beyond the geographical confines of a specific region. All-for-one tourism aims to promote comprehensive and systematic improvements in socioeconomic resources, such as tourism resources, ecological environment, public services, civilization quality, and institutional mechanisms. Li’s (2018) preliminary definition of all-for-one tourism illustrates its potential and dynamism to create a realistic development pattern. As opposed to traditional scenic spots’ tourism development, all-for-one tourism requires the collaboration of all the tourism authorities, all tourism related industries, and all residents in a particular place.

Previous studies have examined various relationships between all-for-one tourism and social and economic development; such
as studies on tourism governance (Mei, 2019; Wu, 2020), public services (Hou, 2017; Yi & Ya, 2016), cultural integration development (Chen, 2018; Zhang & Chen, 2021; Zhao, 2021), poverty alleviation (Dan, 2021), smart tourism development (Chang, 2021; Long, 2021; Qu, 2017; Yin & Zeng, 2015), and rural tourism (Cai et al., 2021; Li et al., 2022; Yao et al., 2020; Zhang & Chen, 2021). Most of these studies explored the theoretical connotations of all-for-one tourism and proposed several ideal development models for all-for-one tourism practices. But most studies were mainly conducted from a macro and supply perspective and therefore were missing the perspectives of diverse tourism stakeholders in China including local authorities, local tourism opinion leaders, residents, and tourism operators. In addition, implementing the all-for-one tourism practice is hampered by the diverse geographical and socioeconomic conditions of China’s tourism destinations.

Travel influencers are recognized as opinion leaders within the tourism factors and are ranked among the external factors that influence tourists’ behaviors (Kotler et al., 2009). Previous literature has investigated the role of travel influencers in shaping tourists’ travel decisions (Pop et al., 2021), promoting tourism destinations (Xu (Rinka) & Pratt, 2018), engaging in word-of-mouth (George et al., 2021), enhancing sustainable tourism development (Baltezarević et al., 2022; Kapoor et al., 2022), and destination image (Gholamhosseinazadeh et al., 2023). However, there is limited focus on the cultural and geographical characteristics of travel influencers in the literature. Ding et al. (2023) indicate that local travel influencers’ cultural identity and geographical characteristics make them local influential role models in the regional tourism community(Ding et al., 2023). The perceptions of travel influencers regarding all-for-one tourism development can contribute to the success of an all-for-one tourism destination.

To the best of our knowledge, previous research studies have not examined local opinion leaders’ viewpoints on the status quo of all-for-one tourism development. This study set out to investigate local tourism opinion leaders’ perceptions about developing an all-for-one tourism destination and the challenges and efforts devoted by local tourism authorities to achieve the concept of an all-for-one tourism destination.

2. Literature Review

2.1 All-for-one Tourism

Previous studies have documented the theoretical and practical significance of all-for-one tourism from various perspectives. Yang (2016) classified all-for-one tourism’s core missions into five dimensions: institutional tourism reforms, tourism-orientated regional development, tourism clusters, integration of all-for-one tourism and socioeconomic development strategies, and reforms of the tourism supply chain. Furthermore, Dai & Yang (2022) illustrated that all-for-one tourism can maximize the utilization of a destination’s diverse and attractive elements to offer a wide range of immersive tourism experiences catering to all aspects of tourists’ demands. According to the Annual Report of China’s All-for-one Tourism (2019), tourists frequently used words like “tourist-friendly,” “convenient,” “high quality,” and “one-stop experience” to describe their perceptions of satisfactory all-for-one tourism services. Likewise, 168 administrative regions were verified by China’s Ministry of Culture and Tourism as the national all-for-one tourism demonstration zones from 2019 to 2020 (Ministry of Culture and Tourism, 2019, 2020).

Moreover, many scholars have investigated diverse tourism themes from the all-for-one tourism supply perspective. Wu (2020) identified market-driven orientation, urban-rural integration, and public service support as essential in promoting innovative all-for-one tourism development in Guangdong Province. Mei (2019) proposed an integrated approach to all-for-one tourism governance combining a tourism governance organization system, tourism management operations, and tourism governance guarantee systems. Tourism public service is the basis of all-for-one tourism development. Hou (2017) showed that tourists have a high demand for internet information-sharing services, convenient transportation, safety notifications and forecasts, medical assistance, safety emergency plans, food safety, star-rated tourist toilets, high-quality tourism services, and tourists’ complaints handling in the Kangbashi District.

Cultural tourism is also one of all-for-one tourism development’s important themes. Chen (2018) proposed a comprehensive cultural system for all-for-one tourism through three subsystems: material culture, institutional and behavioral culture, and spiritual culture. Zhang & Chen (2021) indicated that integrating “all-for-one culture” and “all-for-one tourism” could create an innovative tourism development model by transforming tourism development from traditional scenic spot consumption to immersive culture consumption. Dan (2021) also emphasized that integrating culture into tourism industries would alleviate poverty in impoverished counties.

Several research studies have investigated the role of smart tourism in all-for-one tourism development; smart tourism can avail information, personalization, convenience, and unique tourism services and experiences to tourists. For example, big data can benefit public management, tourism services, and destination marketing thereby enhancing a destination’s competitiveness as posited by Qu (2017). Furthermore, big data facilitates a new bottom-up approach to assessing all-for-one tourism performance, in particular tourists’ satisfaction with destination elements (Chang, 2021). Because traditional scenic spot tourism results in limited community participation, Yin & Zeng (2015) recommended the integration of smart and community tourism into all-for-one tourism to engage residents in sustainable tourism.
In the all-for-one tourism context, rural tourism plays a significant role in promoting China’s rural revitalization and coordinated regional development. Zhang et al. (2022) found that all-for-one tourism and sustainable rural tourism development are mutually supportive and organically integrated in Yuan Jia Village. Furthermore, Li et al. (2022) advanced a framework for integrating rural tourism with all-for-one tourism that included core tourism element integration, rural tourism operation and management platforms, tourism corridors, and tourism intellectual property. Likewise, Cai et al. (2021) stated that all-for-one tourism can help identify rural tourism characteristics and develop the existing environment to optimize rural tourism benefits.

However, research into the connotations of all-for-one tourism is still in its infancy resulting in diverse interpretations and issues. For example, Wang et al. (2018) criticized studies that overly interpreted the concept of all-for-one tourism by attempting to cover all its developmental elements and extend its scope from space to time, consumption, industry, and society; a critique that had profound implications for future research. In addition, Pei (2018) suggested that capital investment, tourism product development, talent introduction, and tourism marketing were key challenges in developing county-level all-for-one tourism in China. Wu (2020) identified three pragmatic all-for-one tourism development issues; lack of multi-governance, rigid marketing standards, and lack of local distinctiveness. In summary, most previous studies focused on the different themes of all-for-one tourism development from the suppliers’ perspective, such as theoretical connotations, governance and management mechanisms, public services, smart tourism, and rural tourism. However, China still faces challenges in the attainment of successful all-for-one tourism; an in-depth analysis of all-for-one tourism practices from diverse tourism opinion leaders’ perspectives would provide valuable insights for future sustainable development.

2.2 Opinion Leadership Theory

The theoretical framework of this study was based on the opinion leadership theory introduced by Lazarsfeld et al. (1948). Rogers & Cartano (1962) first defined opinion leadership as the capacity of an individual to consistently shape others’ opinions or behaviors. Yukl et al. (2002) emphasized that the essence of leadership is influence. Moreover, the influence of opinion leaders lies within a specific domain (Flynn et al., 1996; Shoham & Ruvio, 2008), and opinion leaders are generally recognized as role models within their community who affect others’ opinions, attitudes, and behaviors (Weeks et al., 2017). However, it is challenging to identify an opinion leader in any field since their influence extends across different industries and stakeholders, such as enterprises, consumers, and society. Previous studies indicate that opinion leaders generally share some common characteristics, such as displaying knowledgeable/expertise about a certain field (Wuyts et al., 2011), heavily relying on information sources (Wuyts et al., 2011), being close to innovation (Goldenberg et al., 2009), and showing a high level of product involvement and familiarity (Goldsmith et al., 2003). Nevertheless, the same studies state that opinion leaders should be linked to specific products and contexts.

In the online context, the emergence and application of Web 2.0 transforms ordinary individuals into opinion leaders with unlimited reach. Lyons & Henderson (2005) found that online opinion leaders possessed the characteristics of offline opinion leaders such as high involvement, innovation, exploratory behavior, and self-perceived knowledge. Therefore, social media influencers are regarded as online opinion leaders.

There is scarce literature on opinion leadership in the tourism context. Jamrozy et al. (1996) described nature-based tourism opinion leaders as being involved in many trips and actively utilizing diverse travel information in their travel decisions. Furthermore, travel opinion leaders often perceived themselves as industry experts, believed that they possessed the knowledge that ordinary tourists shared on social media, and they also sought insider knowledge from the tourism industry to share with others (Yoo et al., 2011). Despite the lack of empirical evidence, Oh (1997) emphasized that travel opinion leaders can play a significant role in promoting unknown tourist destinations due to their high communicatory utility.

The rapid popularity of diverse social media applications, such as Blog, Facebook, YouTube, WhatsApp, Tripadvisor, etc., has allowed any user to become an significant social media influencer (Xu et al., 2014). Freberg et al. (2011) defined social media influencers as novel independent third-party endorsers who can shape audience attitudes through diverse content and social media channels. Hence, social media influencers may have developed from traditional opinion leaders (Woelke & Koch, 2016) due to changes in the media landscape along with the rise of Web 2.0 applications. Social media influencers are online opinion leaders who are well-connected to online and offline communities with similar values or interests (Liu et al., 2015). A social media influencer’s follower number is essential in evaluating their impact as larger numbers represent higher trustworthiness among their audiences (A. R. Gómez, 2019; Md Syed & Kwon, 2019; Uzunoğlu & Kip, 2014). In addition, Campbell & Farrell (2020) proposed five criteria to evaluate social media influencers, follower numbers, perceived authenticity, accessibility, professionalism, and cultural capital. However, the influence of social media influencers is limited to a specific field and cannot be exerted in all domains (Ding et al., 2023). Therefore, an investigation into social media influencers as opinion leaders should be restricted to a specific domain.

Travel influencers are recognized as opinion leaders in the tourism context (Kotler et al., 2009). Previous literature
investigated the role of travel influencers from diverse aspects, such as their role in shaping tourists’ travel decisions (Pop et al., 2021), promoting tourism destinations (Xu (Rinka) & Pratt, 2018), engaging in word-of-mouth (George et al., 2021), enhancing sustainable tourism development (Baltezarević et al., 2022; Kapoor et al., 2022), and destination image (Gholamhosseinizadeh et al., 2023). Furthermore, previous studies evaluated the quantitative impacts of travel influencers such as follower numbers, clicks, likes, and reposts. Therefore, a more detailed exploration of the impacts of travel influencers based on specific tourism types and cultural contexts is required. Gómez (2018) highlights that influencers have become an essential element of tourism strategies. Hence, the engagement of relevant local tourism stakeholders is crucial in attaining successful all-for-one tourism development.

3. Methodology

3.1 Research Setting

This study explored the status quo of all-for-one tourism development in Meishan City, China. Meishan is a prefecture-level city located in Sichuan province, China. Meishan had close to 3 million inhabitants in 2020. Meishan is well known by all the Chinese people as the hometown of Su Dongpo (1037-1101 AD), a great poet in the Northern Song Dynasty (960-1127 AD) who was excellent in poetry, prose, calligraphy, and gourmet. His father Su Xun and younger brother Su Zhe were also great poets in Chinese history. Hence, the profound “Three-Su Culture” has maintained its influence on Chinese daily life and the spiritual world for over 1,000 years. Meishan City, the original place of “Three-Su Culture,” has abundant and authentic cultural and historical attractions, such as San Su Shrine, Dongpo Lake Park, Dongpo Urban Wetland Park, Dongpo Impression Water Street, Liujiang Ancient Town, and Han Cliff Tomb Museum. Furthermore, Meishan City is also famous for its unique and delicious local gourmet related to Su Dongpo, such as Dongpo Pork Hock, Dongpo fish, Dongpo Pickles, and Dongpo Pastry. Meishan has abundant cultural, historical, and natural tourism resources that attract several tourists. Despite the COVID-19 pandemic, Meishan City received 49.52 million domestic tourists and an annual tourism revenue of 43.77 billion Yuan in 2021, representing annual growth rates of 23.98 percent and 20.55 percent, respectively (Xinhua, 2022).

In June 2022, China’s President Xi Jinping visited the San Su Shrine, the memorial temple and former residence of Su Xun Su Dongpo, and Su Zhe to learn about the city’s local efforts in protecting historical and cultural heritage. The President then emphasized that the local populace should respect and inherit excellent Chinese traditional culture to improve cultural confidence indicating that the “Three-Su Culture” would be a crucial component in developing cultural tourism in Meishan City (Xinhua, 2022).

The previously mentioned attributes position Meishan City as a potential tourism destination above other destinations. Therefore, in 2016, Meishan City was one of China’s first batch of cities to be selected for the construction of national all-for-one tourism demonstration zones. Until August 2022, Meishan City’s three counties (Dongpo District, Hongya County, and Renshou County) were shortlisted as the provincial all-for-one tourism demonstration zones in Sichuan Province (Sichuan, 2020). Therefore, Meishan City models the implementation of an all-for-one tourism concept in China making it a suitable study setting. However, low-quality scenic spots, imperfect tourism infrastructure, low-value-added tourism products or services, and uncivilized tourism industry employees may hinder the sustainable development of all-for-one tourism in Meishan City.

3.2 Research Design

A case study is a qualitative research methodology typically applied in social science fields. Gustafsson (2017) defined a case study as an intensive study of a person, group, or community to gain in-depth understanding through systematic investigation and examination of data. Interviews are one of the most popular qualitative data collection methods utilized to gain in-depth information about targeted participants’ experiences and perspectives about a particular topic (Iii & Hagstrom-Schmidt, 2022). This qualitative case study, that is grounded in an interpretivism paradigm, aims to gain an in-depth understanding of all-for-one tourism development from the local travel influencer’s perspective as an opinion leader.

3.3 Data Collection and Analysis

Study participants were purposively sampled to select individuals or groups that were closely related to and familiarized with the phenomenon of interest (Crowe et al., 2011). Study participants had to be local travel influencers who had firsthand knowledge or experience as tourists, local tourism opinion leaders, and residents in their daily tourism content creation and marketing activities. Participants had to meet the following selection criteria which were summarized as four dimensions: (1) maintain a weekly update on their social media accounts, (2) have at least 10,000 followers; thus recognized as micro-influencers in the influencer marketing field (Campbell & Farrell, 2020), (3) be solely focused on local tourism themes and had once collaborated with local tourism officials or stakeholders to promote local tourism services or products, and (4) worked, studied, or lived in Meishan City, China. In this study, fifteen local travel influencers from Meishan City were interviewed about their perspectives regarding all-for-one tourism. Study participants’ demographic information as of December 2022 is displayed in Table 1.
Table 1. Participants’ demographic information

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Gender</th>
<th>Occupation</th>
<th>Themes</th>
<th>Number of followers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td>Humanity</td>
<td>15,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Professional content creator</td>
<td>Gourmet and local customs</td>
<td>1,030,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Graphic designer</td>
<td>Gourmet and rural life</td>
<td>20,400</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Photographer</td>
<td>Nature, history, and culture</td>
<td>17,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Content creator</td>
<td>City landscape and tourism event publicity</td>
<td>35,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Government staff</td>
<td>Agricultural and cultural tourism</td>
<td>23,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>7</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Content creator</td>
<td>Aerial content of city landscape</td>
<td>40,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>8</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>History and culture</td>
<td>32,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Photojournalist</td>
<td>Local tourism and everyday life</td>
<td>25,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>10</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Bank clerk</td>
<td>Local culture and customs</td>
<td>114,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Car salesman</td>
<td>Camping</td>
<td>20,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>12</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Student</td>
<td>Culture, architecture, and night landscape</td>
<td>40,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>E-commerce marketer</td>
<td>Local tourism attractions</td>
<td>20,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Female</td>
<td>Professional content creator</td>
<td>Local dialect, culture, and local everyday life</td>
<td>6,150,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>15</td>
<td>Male</td>
<td>Teacher</td>
<td>History, culture, and local customs</td>
<td>50,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: Created by author

In-depth face-to-face interviews in both Chinese Mandarin and the local language were conducted in Meishan City from June to August 2022. Interviewees were asked general questions about the development of all-for-one tourism in Meishan City within two main categories: the challenges in implementing the all-for-one tourism concept and the efforts undertaken to promote all-for-one tourism development. Each interview session lasted between 45 minutes to 75 minutes and was recorded using digital recorders. An inductive thematic analysis was employed to analyze interview transcripts and generate codes, themes, categories, and patterns related to the research objectives. This study adopted the six-step thematic analysis procedures proposed by Braun and Clarke (2006): (1) familiarize the researchers with entire interview transcripts, (2) generate initial codes based on entire interview transcripts, (3) search for themes from initial codes, (4) review and revise identified themes, (5) define and name the themes, and (6) draft a report based on the research objectives.

4. Results

4.1 Challenges Experienced When Developing an All-for-one Tourism Destination

The identified challenges were summarized into three dimensions: (1) the lack of a clear tourism strategy, (2) uncoordinated development of the tourism sector, and (3) low-quality public service. (Table 2)

Table 2. Challenges in attaining an all-for-one tourism destination in Meishan City

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimensions</th>
<th>Subthemes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lack of a clear tourism strategy</td>
<td>Misunderstanding the all-for-one tourism concept, unclear and impractical tourism strategies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Uncoordinated development of the tourism sector</td>
<td>Imbalanced development, homogeneous development</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Low-quality public services</td>
<td>Traffic congestion, social conflicts, limited toilets, unreasonable prices, and tourism complaints</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.1.1 Lack of a Clear Tourism Strategy

Interview results revealed a misunderstanding of the concept of all-for-one tourism, and unclear and impractical tourism strategies consistent with previous findings that showed that many local governments misunderstood the all-for-one tourism concept in industry practice and would use administrative power to blindly allocate resources for planning and construction (Wang et al., 2018). Furthermore, not all regions were suited to an all-for-one tourism development model due to differences in tourism and social resources. Regional tourism development require a holistic assessment of the local conditions and the formulation of a customized tourism strategy to maximize its values (Zhou, 2019). Seven respondents underscored the misunderstanding of the all-for-one tourism concept and unplanned scientific tourism in Meishan City. They claimed that some counties still focused on developing traditional scenic spot tourism destinations through blind imitation and competition between counties. For instance: “I still discovered that there lacks sufficient scientific communication between the counties of Meishan, and they currently imitate and compete blindly.....the county-level government does not seem to understand the sprites of all-for-one tourism campaigns. They remain in the previous development mode of scenic spots.” (Respondent 7, 2022)

In addition, eight respondents expressed their concerns about unclear and practical tourism strategies suggesting that the local government’s focus was on the quantity of tourist attractions rather than on tourism quality. As mentioned by Respondent 9, certain regions excessively emphasized on the number of magnificent tourist buildings resulting in low cultural connotation, poor tourism experiences, and wasted social resources. For instance: “Cultural tourism in Meishan only focuses on constructing tall and magnificent antique buildings and ignores the integration of cultural connotation and cultural experience. The development of local or international cultural tourism projects in Meishan might be risky, and some projects may not be completed due to capital, land planning, and other reasons, resulting in a waste of resources.”

4.1.2 Uncoordinated Development in the Tourism Sector

Study findings also illustrated uncoordinated development as the second challenge for all-for-one tourism development in Meishan City, China. Uncoordinated development in the tourism sector refers to an imbalanced and homogeneous development; to the findings of previous researchers showed that the development of all-for-one tourism was mainly concentrated in China’s tourism hot spots (Ministry of Culture and Tourism, 2020). However, the all-for-one tourism development should promote the transition from scenic spot tourism to an all-for-one tourism model by focusing on unbalanced regional development. Nine respondents generally agreed that imbalanced development exists between six counties within Meishan City. Interestingly, the regions with optimal tourism resources received more investments, while counties with poor tourism resources received less investments. For instance: “Meishan’s tourism investment was mainly concentrated in the tourism development of Dongpo District, while the investment in other surrounding districts and counties was relatively smaller.” (Respondent 13, 2022)

Moreover, five respondents indicated that homogenous development among six counties ought to be addressed, particularly in relation to the blind imitations of popular scenic spots. For instance: “Renshou and Danling county have already replicated and constructed their own “Water Street” just due to the success of Dongpo Water Street in the Dongpo district.” (Respondent 7, 2022).

4.1.3 Low-quality Public Service

Public service support is one of the crucial aspects of promoting all-for-one tourism development. But the contradiction between the supply and demand of tourism public services still exists. Suboptimal tourism public service hinders the implementation of an all-for-one tourism campaign in Meishan City, China. Seven respondents mentioned that the subthemes of low-quality tourism public service include traffic congestion, social conflicts, unreasonable prices, and tourism complaints. Three respondents reported that traffic congestion was mainly caused by the sharp increase in tourists, particularly during the holidays. Furthermore, five respondents indicated that the pressure from the upsurge of tourists on existing tourism or public infrastructures resulted in social conflicts between residents and tourists. For example, Respondent 3 stated that “there are many conflicts between residents and outside tourists over the parking space near Dongpo Water Street.” In addition, another two respondents claimed that the upsurge of tourists resulting from promotion by social media influencers exceeded the capacity of certain scenic spots. Such unpleasant tourist experiences due to insufficient reasonable supervision and management usually led to frequent tourists’ complaints. For instance: Local tourism vloggers in Meishan often attract tourists to some tourist attractions through attractive videos, which causes enormous pressure on the operation of the scenic spots. Eventually, these conditions will lead to tourist complaints. Local governments should not ignore these issues (Respondent 12, 2022).

Finally, three respondents pointed out that some food sellers inside the scenic spots sold their foodstuffs at a higher price than the price offered at non-tourist spots. Such unreasonable prices adversely influence tourists’ overall perceptions of scenic spots in Meishan City. For instance: “The main problem is the unreasonable charges, such as 30 RMB for a bowl of noodles (the average local price is 8 RMB), and the phenomenon of "ripping off" customers is endless.” (Respondent 2, 2022)
4.2 Efforts Made to Attain an All-for-one Tourism Destination Status

The city’s local government had made many efforts to improve the quality of all-for-one tourism destinations in Meishan as displayed in Table 3.

Table 3. Local government efforts to achieve an all-for-one tourism destination in Meishan City

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dimensions</th>
<th>Subthemes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Public service system</td>
<td>Convenient internal and external transport network, 3A-level tourism toilet, smart tourism, regional tourism distribution center, tourism volunteering services.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism supply chain</td>
<td>Diversified cultural tourism attractions, unique cultural performances and activities, and country-specific products.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tourism market order</td>
<td>Quick responses to tourism complaints, and free volunteer services inside the scenic spots, overall civilized quality of residents.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Destination brand strategy</td>
<td>City-level and county-level destination brand strategy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing effectiveness</td>
<td>The incredible popularity of cultural tourism, promoting featured tourism products, providing tourism information, building a destination’s image and attracting offline tourists.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

4.2.1 Public Service System

In the all-for-one tourism context, integrating urban and rural construction, and the construction of shared tourism infrastructure and public services would contribute to the development of all-for-one tourism demonstration zones (Zhao et al., 2019). Five subthemes related to the public service system were identified including internal and external transportation, 3A-level tourism toilets, tourism distribution centers, smart tourism, and tourism volunteering services.

Six respondents highlighted that the city had completed the construction and enhancement internal and external transport network in Meishan City, including high-speed trains, district-, and county-level transport, urban and rural transport, and tourism fast lanes between scenic spots and free parking inside the scenic spots. The available various modes of transportation made tourists’ visits convenient and comfortable. For instance, Respondent 7 mentioned that “tourism fast lanes between scenic spots have increased and make it convenient for tourists to move.” Two respondents made positive remarks about the quantity and quality of tourism toilets, particularly those inside the scenic spots and rural regions that made the spots tourist-friendly. Respondent 13 described innovations in public services as follows, “some regions even built public toilets as 3A-level tourism toilets by integrating local cultural elements.” Two respondents emphasized that smart tourism would address tourism governance and service intelligence in Meishan City. For instance, Respondent 9 stated that “[t]he local government can guide the traffic flow and people flow in scenic spots through big data and visual monitoring systems.” Additionally, Respondent 7 was concerned about the construction of a regional tourism distribution center to provide tourists with information and display regional cultural and historical elements. Finally, two respondents mentioned that the quality and efficiency of tourism volunteering services had been improved to enhance tourists’ experiences and the overall quality of the service industry in Meishan City. For instance, Respondent 9 mentioned that “the construction of a tourist information center and volunteer service counter has also enhanced the quality and sufficiency of the tourism public services, thus improving the quality of tourism services in this city.”

4.2.2 Tourism Supply Chain

Reforming the tourism supply chain is crucial in advancing all-for-one tourism development as it provides tourists with a diverse range of immersive experiences by effectively utilizing a destination’s attractive elements (Dai & Yang, 2022; Yang, 2016). The integration of cultural and tourism industries, a vital development path, encompasses essential components such as material cultural products, behavioral culture, and spiritual culture (Chen, 2018). This research study identified three subthemes of the tourism supply chain that support the transformation of the all-for-one tourism supply chain including diversified cultural tourism attractions, unique cultural performances and activities, and country-specific products.

Examples of diverse tourist attractions include cultural and historical attractions, rural tourism camping sites, and international cultural tourism projects. Ten respondents strongly agreed that the quantity and quality of cultural, historical, and humanistic tourist attractions have been enhanced and upgraded through the utilization of local tourism resources. Respondent 3 commented: “The developmental potential of all-for-one tourism in Meishan is evident, for instance, the natural landscape of Wawu Mountain Scenic Area, Cao Yu Beach, Black Dragon Lake, etc., and historical and humanistic
attractions, including Sansu Shrine, Pengzu Mountain, Zhongyan Temple, Huazang Temple, etc. ” (Respondent 3, 2022). Furthermore, Respondent 4 stated that “Meishan intends to enhance tourists’ understanding and cultural confidence in China’s excellent history and culture through visiting cultural tourism attractions.” Five respondents mentioned that the increase in rural camping sites had made some traditional rural villages become popular niche tourist attractions. Respondent 11 stated: “I really felt the charm of the village and town scenery during the camping, reflecting the diversification of Meishan tourism.” In addition, many internationally renowned cultural tourism projects have been built or are under construction making Meishan tourism internationally competitive. As Respondent 11 confidently described: “The internationalization of Meishan's all-for-one tourism has achieved significant progress, highlighted by the introduction of attractions like Legoland, the Peppa Pig theme park, and the recently opened Meishan Wecom International Cultural and Creative Base. These endeavors have contributed to a more diversified Meishan tourism landscape.”

As regards unique cultural performances and activities, nine respondents voiced that the immersed cultural performances and activities based on the Dongpo culture provided tourists with memorable sensory and spiritual tourism experiences. Respondent 9 stated that “Dongpo Water Street would be the most important place for enjoying immersed cultural performances and activities in Meishan City.” (Figure 1)

![Figure 1. Dongpo Water Street (Source: Created by authors)](image)

When asked about county-specific tourism products, three respondents highlighted the potential of affordable but attractive local gourmet as a distinctive selling point, given that each county boasts its own unique culinary specialties. For instance, Respondent 9 said, “Meishan’s culinary offerings could serve as a prominent feature of Meishan’s all-for-one tourism, with each district and county showcasing its own unique culinary highlights.” Furthermore, there is an emerging industrial model characterized by the concept of “one county, one distinctive fruit (product).” Four respondents highlighted Meishan’s signature seasonal fruits that enjoy considerable popularity in both online and offline markets as a compelling and high-quality offering that enhances tourism development. As Respondent 3 proudly recalled: “I have often cooperated with the Meishan tourism department to carry out the live streaming business, mainly recommending Meishan's featured fruits and tourism specialty. For example, Aiyuan jelly oranges in Dongpo District.”

4.2.3 Tourism Market Order

Previous tourism market governance was largely centered on government departments and tourism enterprises and overlooked the role of other stakeholders. In the all-for-one tourism context, the governance of the tourism market order should involve the collaboration of government departments, tourism businesses, residents, and third-party organizations (Bao, 2018). Five respondents stated that the tourism authorities in Meishan City had made many service-oriented efforts to improve the tourism market order, including quick responses to tourism complaints and free volunteer services inside the scenic spots. For example: “The government's service awareness has also been continuously improved. Whether dealing with tourist complaints or scenic spot management services, I have observed that almost every scenic spot provides free volunteer services to promptly solve tourists' relevant problems.” (Respondent 7, 2022).

Another four respondents stated that the overall civilization of the locality had been greatly enhanced by the construction
of a national civilized and sanitary city in Meishan; a feature that promises a promising tourism market environment. For instance: “With the creation of civilized and sanitary cities in recent years, the civilization of the residents in Meishan has improved, and the tourism environment in all districts and counties has improved.” (Respondent 2,2022)

4.2.4 Destination Brand Strategy

A destination’s brand influence is a significant dimension of national all-for-one tourism demonstration zones (Ministry of Culture and Tourism, 2020). Local government should emphasize the uniqueness and innovation of a region’s tourism resources in developing a tourism branding system that represents tourist attractions and products tailored to a specific destination (Li, 2020; Wang & Geng, 2018). This study identified two dimensions of destination brand strategy that guide tourism marketing and branding activities; city-level and county-level destination brand strategies that both unified a city’s tourism brand with a distinctive local tourism brand in each region.

By displaying its rich historical and cultural resources, Meishan City is emerging as a prominent tourist destination at the county level, consistent with prior research advocating for innovative tourism development through the integration of an all-for-one tourism culture and all-for-one tourism development (Zhang & Chen, 2021). Four respondents mentioned that Meishan City has recognized the “San Su Culture” as one of its’ core competitive advantages that could display unique its tourism characteristics and build a positive city image. For instance:

In June 2022, Chinese President Xi Jinping came to Meishan for inspection, especially after visiting the San Su Shrine. Meishan attaches more and more importance to cultural tourism implying that the governments at all levels of Meishan will invest more human resources, material resources, and financial resources to develop cultural tourism. (Respondent 6,2022)

At the county level, each district or county had determined its unique tourism characteristics with a view to building a distinctive county-level destination image. Six respondents mentioned that the Dongpo district regards cultural tourism as a core branding strategy, particularly the development of various famous cultural attractions and activities based on “San Su Culture.” For instance: “Dongpo Water Street holds the top position among Meishan’s tourist attractions most sought after by visitors. In the media sector, it is referred to as the "2020 Sichuan’s No. 1 Cultural Tourism IP". In the initial nine months of 2020, it welcomed over 3 million tourists from both within and outside the province.” (Respondent 9,2022)

Two respondents mentioned that Pengshan District regards Chinese longevity culture as its core cultural destination element that would position Pengshan as a cultural tourism and wellness tourist destination. For instance: “Pengshan District mainly shapes the image of longevity culture for regional tourism. According to this cultural tourism image, Pengshan primarily focuses on health and wellness tourism, such as the Sino-Japanese Wellness City, the Sino-French Agricultural Science and Technology Park, and China Pengzushan Health and Elderly Cultural City.” (Respondent 13,2022)

Five respondents mentioned that Qingshen County had identified the national cultural heritage of “Qingshen Bamboo Weaving” as its core attraction to position it as a bamboo cultural destination. This had resulted in the successful implementation of various bamboo artistic weaving and research tourism projects. Respondent 9 stated that “Qingshen has utilized 'Bamboo Weaving' as the core cultural element to create hotels, tourist attractions, and bamboo weaving experiential projects, which strengthen the good experiences of Meishan tourism.”

Four respondents reported that Hongya County regarded eco-tourism as its central advantageous tourism resource. It emphasized the organic combination of rural tourism, natural tourism, and a hot spring vacation. For instance: “What impresses me profoundly is the "eco-tourism" in Hongya county. It has attracted many tourists inside and outside the province in recent years by combining different tourism experiences projects such as rural tourism, natural sightseeing, and hot spring vacation.” (Respondent 14,2022).

Five respondents mentioned that Renshou County aimed to become a livable and leisure destination by promoting gourmet, entertainment, and a suitable living environment to tourists as Renshou County had no influential and competitive tourist attractions. For instance, Respondent 14 described it as follows, “Renshou County has built 14 urban parks to serve the fitness and sightseeing demands of regional tourists and residents.”

Finally, two respondents mentioned that Danling County mainly regarded agriculture and gourmet as its core competitive advantage. Respondent 13 mentioned that “I mainly promote Danling as an agricultural sightseeing and gourmet tourism in my content.”

4.2.5 Marketing Effectiveness

In all-for-one tourism, the tourism industry should combine tourism marketing with “experience economy” and “internet+” by seamlessly integrating online and offline marketing channels to effectively build an attractive tourism destination
image (Li, 2020). This study identified five subthemes related to marketing effectiveness, including the incredible popularity of cultural tourism, promoting featured tourism products, providing tourism information, building a destination’s image, and attracting offline tourists.

Almost all the respondents agreed that cultural tourism attractions and performances had gained tremendous popularity through social media marketing strategies. Interestingly, Dongpo Water Street, the most popular cultural attraction, receives excellent internet exposure that also generates spillover effects to other surrounding tourist attractions. Respondent 10 mentioned that “the spillover effects of Dongpo Water Street have made many other related cultural attractions benefit from it.”

Furthermore, four respondents stated that social media marketing was an effective method in promoting featured tourism products by facilitating the achievement of several clicks, and product sales, and displaying competitive tourism products to a large audience. For example, Respondent 14 recalled that “we achieved millions of views and marketing sales by selling Qingshen Ponkan and other featured products via livestreaming e-commerce on social media platforms.” These channels have helped to combine Meishan City’s image with unique tourism products across the county.

In addition, seven respondents indicated that local official social media accounts were effective in spreading accurate and timely tourism information about a destination. Respondent 11 stated that “official social media operations mainly communicate official tourism information and display the tourism development in Meishan City.”

Finally, two respondents mentioned official social media activities had attracted many offline tourists to visit or attend tourism events in Meishan City. For instance, Respondent 13 reported that “diverse official social media activities indeed have profound impacts on tourists’ behaviors and attract many surrounding tourists to visit and consume in Meishan.”

5. Conclusion, Recommendations, and Limitations of the Study

Currently, there are national tourism development campaigns for the creation of all-for-one tourism demonstration zones in China. Consequently, assessing the status quo of all-for-one tourism development is crucial for sustainable development. Destination policymakers need to understand the all-for-one tourism developmental status from various all-for-one tourism campaigns such as those done in Meishan City. But this case study cannot deduce information such as “Meishan has several optimally constructed all-for-one tourism demonstration zones” or “Meishan has a suboptimal number of all-for-one tourism demonstration zones.” Nonetheless, the study findings provide significant insights into the overall importance of the all-for-one tourism demonstration zones widely realized in Meishan City in response to a call for more studies to explore the concept and industry practice of all-for-one tourism (Wang et al., 2018).

From the practical perspective, Meishan City has made many interrelated efforts to realize the concept of all-for-one tourism as evidenced by the primary evaluation index of national all-for-one tourism demonstration zones (Ministry of Culture and Tourism, 2020).

From the theoretical perspective, local travel influencers, as local tourism opinion leaders, have lots of firsthand knowledge or experiences, and act as residents, tourists, and tourism promoters in Meishan City. Thus, they can positively contribute their knowledge and experiences in shaping and promoting regional tourism development. Previous literature denotes that the role of travel influencers goes beyond tourism marketing to promoting a new destination or new tourism products, and supporting the travel community development (Ding et al., 2023). Hence, this study contributes to the theoretical understanding of the all-for-one tourism concept through diverse tourism stakeholders’ perspectives by the application of opinion leadership theory in the tourism context.

Several recommendations can be made to promote the effective implementation of the all-for-one tourism concept in Meishan City, China. First, transparent and effective tourism development strategies should be spelt out across different government levels. But the local adaptation of all-for-one tourism to different places requires local governments to assess its interplay with specific destinations. Second, a well-planned and sustainable all-for-one tourism development strategy should be based on a thorough understanding of the destination’s tourism supply chain to promote effective tourism scenic spot management mechanism, tourism industry governance mechanism, and tourism public service management mechanism for coordinated all-for-one tourism development and fair distribution of social resources among different regions. Third, to improve the quality of public services, the all-for-one tourism development should emphasize full participation of all people from a destination including residents. Unfortunately, interviewees indicated that frequent social conflicts had occurred between tourists and residents regarding the use of public services. Furthermore, the local government should strengthen tourism public services and infrastructure supply from various stakeholders to alleviate the tension between tourists and residents.

This study had some limitations. First, this study focused on only local travel influencers in Meishan, China. Therefore, study findings cannot be generalized to other destinations. Second, this study utilized a qualitative research method to interview only 15 local travel influencers, thus its findings only reflect their understanding of all-for-one tourism. Future
studies with more participants using both quantitative and qualitative methodology should be conducted in other destinations. Third, study participants were limited to local travel influencers, yet the all-for-one tourism concept emphasizes “full participation and full-sharing” across society. Future research should investigate the perspectives of tourism authorities, residents, and tourists to better understand how all-for-one tourism is conceptualized, planned, implemented, and operated.

Acknowledgments
Not applicable.

Authors contributions
Sample: Dr. AAA and Dr. BBB were responsible for study design and revising. Prof. CCC was responsible for data collection. Prof. DDD drafted the manuscript and Prof. CCC revised it. All authors read and approved the final manuscript. In this paragraph, also explain any special agreements concerning authorship, such as if authors contributed equally to the study.

Funding
Identify grants or other financial support (and the source, if appropriate) for your research.
Sample: This work was supported by YYYY Foundation [project number 888899999].

Competing interests
Sample: The authors declare that they have no known competing financial interests or personal relationships that could have appeared to influence the work reported in this paper.

Informed consent
Obtained.

Ethics approval
The Publication Ethics Committee of the Redfame Publishing.
The journal’s policies adhere to the Core Practices established by the Committee on Publication Ethics (COPE).

Provenance and peer review
Not commissioned; externally double-blind peer reviewed.

Data availability statement
The data that support the findings of this study are available on request from the corresponding author. The data are not publicly available due to privacy or ethical restrictions.

Data sharing statement
No additional data are available.

Open access
This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/).

Copyrights
Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the journal.

References


Dan, S. (2021). Research on the (establishment of) path of realizing the targeted poverty alleviation through tourism under the perspective of all-for-one tourism. 251. https://doi.org/10.1051/e3conf/202125103024


Ministry of Culture and Tourism, C. (2019). The announcement of the first batch of national all-for-one tourism demonstration zones, the ministry of culture and tourism, China. https://m.thepaper.cn/baijiahao_4346627


WTTC. (2023). *Travel & Tourism Economic Impact | World Travel & Tourism Council (WTTC)*. https://wttc.org/research/economic-impact


